

**NATIONAL JOINT**  
**HEALTH, SAFETY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE**

**ONE HUNDRED AND THIRTY SIXTH Meeting of the Committee held at ENA Office on September 18<sup>th</sup> 2019 at 11:00 to 15:30.**

**Present**

Chair

Geoff Earl (GE) ..... (Chair)

Electricity Company Members

Phil Swift (PS).....Western Power Distribution  
Lee Wallace (LW) ..... Western Power Distribution  
Matt Richardson (MR) ..... EDF Energy  
Dan Randles (DR).....Electricity North West  
Doug Smart (DSm).....EDF Energy  
Gary Evans (GE).....ScottishPower Energy Networks

Trade Union Members

Mike Macdonald (MM) ..... Prospect  
Chris Warburton (CW) ..... Prospect  
Bud Hudspith (BH) ..... Unite  
Dan Shears (DSh).....GMB  
Neil Freeman (NF).....Prospect  
Tracy Kellegher (TK).....Unison  
Dave Hodgson (DH).....Unite

Others

David Lefefer (DL).....HSE  
Mike Leppard (ML).....ENA  
David Spillett (DS).....ENA  
Paul Fidler (PF).....ENA

**Item Title**  
**1 Welcome Introductions and Apologies**

GE gave an introduction to all attendees, noting that this was the 136<sup>th</sup> time that this committee had sat.

Apologies were noted from Gareth Piggot (ScottishPower), Rodney Ballentine (Northern Ireland Electricity Networks), Richard Gough (Scottish & Southern Electricity Networks), Peter McIntosh (Unite), David Griffiths (SSE), Alan Feakins (EDF Energy), Jonathan Green (Prospect), John Ayre (EDF Energy), Neil Thomson (SSE), Frank Monaghan (ScottishPower), Johnathan Green (Prospect), Dave Whitcombe (Unite), Martin Allen (GMB), Dave Morgan (Unite), Dominic Fletcher (Unite), Graham Smith (National Grid) Clive Broutta GMB (E.ON) Ben Richards (Energy UK)

## **2 Review of minutes for meeting held on 27 June 2019 (HESAC832)**

### **2.1 Accuracy**

The committee undertook a review of the minutes from the previous National HESAC (HESAC832) held 27<sup>th</sup> June 2019. Minor corrections were requested to the attendee list.

It was agreed that all actions were either complete or carried forward onto the 18/09/19 meeting agenda.

### **2.2 Matters Arising**

**Action 1:** Terms of Reference for the group are to be updated to reflect a chair's tenure is to be a 2-year term rather than a 1-year term.

- *This action was completed*

**Action 2:** All members to ensure that they have at least one alternative to ensure attendance to the meeting. If any members have any specific feedback on constitution amendments, they are to contact DS.

- *Members of the committee who had not yet provided an alternate to follow up with DS at the earliest opportunity. Please refer to section 3.1 of these minutes.*

**Action 3:** GE to share work on codes of practice for asbestos work.

- *This action was completed*

**Action 4:** MD to take away to the Energy UK Retail Health and Safety Forum concerns of the retail sector not being covered by an asbestos guidance. Energy UK representative to update at the next meeting.

- *This is carried forward to the next meeting in January 2020.*

**Action 5:** All members of HESAC to provide any speaking opportunities for the PI Champions to RG.

- *Members continue to look out for appropriate speaking opportunities for Sue Ferns and Peter Emery. This is an on-going matter and will be a standard agenda item going forward. Please refer to section 8.3 of these minutes.*

**Action 6:** DL to share HSE's information on Wooden Pole Hammer Testing concerns.

- *DL reported back via email that he is unable to share the information at this time. There are still some internal discussions on-going at HSE. To be left on the agenda for discussion at next meeting.*

**Action 7:** GE to share updated Asbestos safety bulletin via ENA SHE Managers Forum and to any National HESAC members specifically requesting it.

- *This action was completed*

### **3 Terms of reference (TORs) Update (HESAC834)**

#### **3.1 Membership**

Referencing paper HESAC 834 DS provided a brief update on the latest ToR draft. Following a short discussion on latest draft

***Action: DS has recommended that actual names of members and alternates should not be included on the TOR but only include details of the member's companies/organisations. The members agreed to this and DS will update the TOR accordingly.***

***Action: There were several additional comments provided by the members which DS will also reflect in a revised v7 of the ToR and following this update will circulate via email a revised version (v7) for final approval.***

#### **4. 2019 N HESAC Annual Report**

It was agreed at the meeting in March 2019 that a short two page annual summary report should be produced toward the end of each calendar year summarising for example HESAC attendance, membership, key issues, actions of note any notable progress etc from that preceding year. The incumbent secretariat will produce the draft report for committee comment/approval and subsequently publish the report on the PI website.

***Action: DS, BR and MM to prepare draft summary report template and circulate for comment. This will be circulated no later than Friday 11 October with one week for comments.***

***Action: From 20 October commence drafting report for comment aiming for final publication by December 31/12 or first week in January.***

The committee noted progress but were keen to see the template circulated asap.

#### **5. Asbestos Guidance - Updates from EUK, (AMO Guidance) & ENA Task Force**

##### **5.1 EUK, (AMO Guidance)**

As the UK Energy representative was on leave and no update was available it was agreed that BR should prepare a short written update at the earliest opportunity which could be shared with the members via email.

***Action: BR to provide a written update on the progress of the work of the AMO Asbestos Guidance Collaboration sub group and share with the members at the earliest opportunity via email but no later than 30/10.***

##### **5.2 ENA Task Force**

ML provided the committee with a short update on the work of the ENA's Asbestos task group (Atg). The background and context was set out for new members of the HESAC. This group is focusing on networks asbestos issues ranging from Office Buildings to Substations to Cut outs to Switchgear etc.

The aim and objective of the Atg is to review and ensure from a network operations perspective they were in line with the regulations and its guidance and to compare and contrast individual member companies policies and practices which are not surprisingly very similar because the requirements are well set out, but there is always an opportunity to share best practice and learning etc. Over the next two months there are two key aims. The first is to develop an industry position paper on managing asbestos from a networks

perspective. The second is to develop a networks front line staff guidance sheet. The aim is to have a draft ENA position paper by the end of 2019.

**Action: ML will provide a further update on the progress of the ENA Asbestos Task Group at the next meeting.**

The committee noted progress.

## **6. Hexavalent Chromium (HC)**

It was previously agreed that the HC issue should remain as an agenda item for the foreseeable future.

MMc set out the context and background to this issue. HC is a highly regulated toxic carcinogen. A safety bulletin has been shared across the industry and a HC briefing has been published on the Energy UK H&S website.

The HC continues to be monitored through the Energy UK Safety Leaders and they have compiled a summary of all the relevant items of information that had been gathered from the various suppliers of gas turbines that are seeing this problem. It was therefore agreed that this issue should be passed from HESAC to the Energy UK Safety Leaders group for future oversight

**Action: MMc will discuss this issue with DS<sub>m</sub> and BR and will request that Hexavalent Chromium should be monitored for the foreseeable future at the Energy UK Safety Leaders forum and removed as a regular HESAC standing agenda item.**

## **7. Occupational Health**

### **7.1 National EMF Cohort Study**

Referencing paper HESAC 835 ML provided the members with an update from the recently published Cancer incidence in UK electricity generation and transmission workers (1973–2015) report. Extract of the study had been circulated to the HESAC for information. Link to the full report can be found [here](#).

Key summary:

**Background** - Long-term health outcomes in cohorts of workers from the electricity supply industry have been studied.

**Aims** - The aim of the study was to examine updated cancer incidence findings among a cohort of UK electricity generation and transmission workers.

**Methods** - Cancer morbidity experienced by 81 616 employees of the former Central Electricity Generating Board of England and Wales was investigated for the period 1973–2015. All employees had worked for at least 6 months with some employment between 1973 and 1982. Standardized registration ratios (SRRs) were calculated based on national rates.

**Results** - Overall cancer morbidity was slightly below expectation in males. Significant excesses were found in male workers for mesothelioma (observed [Obs] 763, SRR 326), skin cancer (non-melanoma) (Obs 5616, SRR 106), and prostate cancer (Obs 4298, SRR 106), and in female workers for cancer of the small intestine (Obs 13, SRR 220), nasal cancer (Obs 11, SRR 407), and breast cancer (Obs 758, SRR 110). More detailed analyses showed important contrasts, particularly for mesothelioma, lung cancer, skin cancer, prostate cancer and breast cancer.

**Conclusions** - A clear occupational excess of mesothelioma was not matched by a corresponding excess of asbestos induced lung cancer. Confident interpretation of the excesses of cancers of the nasal cavities and small intestine is not possible, although occupational exposures received in this industry may well not be involved. An excess of skin cancer in transmission workers may be associated with outdoor working.

### **Key Learning Points**

#### **What is already known about this subject:**

- This survey was set up in the 1980s to learn more about the long-term health of employees in the UK electricity supply industry.
- In the intervening years, a series of 11 papers have found no convincing links between estimated exposure to magnetic fields and a number of health outcomes.
- This new report was prepared to provide a more complete assessment of cancer risks in the cohort, incorporating a further 6 years of follow-up data.

#### **What this study adds:**

- The cohort continues to experience an occupational excess of mesothelioma without any matching excess of lung cancer.
- Outdoor working may have been a factor in excess of skin cancer (non-melanoma).
- Excesses in females for nasal cancer and cancer of the small intestine were not matched by similar findings in males.

#### **What impact this may have on practice, policy or procedure:**

- The findings reinforce the need for regulations that protect workers from asbestos exposure and the advice given to outdoor workers concerning sun exposure.
- The findings provide indirect evidence that further control of magnetic fields exposure is probably not needed.
- Employees who have been exposed to asbestos should continue to be encouraged not to smoke to reduce the risk of asbestos-related lung cancer.

DSh welcomed the latest report but raised some concerns regarding some of the assumptions contained in the report for example the comments relating to Hexavalent Chromium. ML to feed the comments back to the Mortality Study Group for consideration.

ML informed the members that DR Haley Tripp National Grid is willing to attend the next meeting to provide a further update on the report following the next meeting of the Mortality Steering group.

***Action: ML to feed the members comments back to the Mortality Study Group for consideration.***

***Action: ML to invite DR Haley Tripp to the next meeting of the National HESAC for further update on the findings of the report.***

The committee noted developments.

### **7.2 Energy UK Update**

In the absence of BR this update was held over to the next meeting.

### **7.3 ENA Update**

ML provided the committee with an update on the progress of the ENA Occupational health programme which overseen by the ENA Occupational Health committee (OHC). The committee is made of experts from Health & Safety, Occupational hygienists, Company nurses and other member company representatives. This committee produces a

business plan (copy was circulated following last meeting) which sets out the aspirations of the committee for the next three years and aligns with the last three years of the Powering Improvement strategy.

The committee are looking at the priorities for the industry in terms of the top three risks i.e musculo-skeletal disorders, mental health and stress and other public health issues of today such as obesity and cancers etc which are impacting on employees.

A key topic of notable interest to the HESAC and being reviewed by the committee is fatigue management which is an issue of some concerns across the utilities sector. This will be a key deliverable in the Powering Improvement strategy for 2020-2025.

As chair of the OH committee GE reaffirmed and fully endorsed MMc's comments and his support of the ongoing work in particular the two key areas of Fatigue management and Mental Health/Stress. GE also referenced the strong membership of the committee.

A third area which is taking time up of the committee is maintaining is the OH roadmap. A further update on the progress of the work of the ENA OH committee will be provided at the next meeting

The committee noted progress.

#### **7.4 Fatigue Management**

MMc provided some background and context to the issue of Fatigue Management which included reference to the working time directive, the hours of work, the Cadent incident, the effectiveness of management processes and the challenge of member companies reducing CMLs and keeping the lights on.

Strategic issues identified by TUs are:

1. Clarifying where do responsibilities lie with managing fatigue;
2. How do we plan the correct organisational resources and management for out of hours working to reduce individuals working excessive hours;
3. How do we build this into future re-organisations?

Following further discussions and noting the ongoing investigations of the Cadent incident and the work of the ENA Occupational Health committee it was agreed that Fatigue management is a key issue and should remain as a standard agenda item going forward. The TUs would also like the HESAC to consider if the unions could be given some time to provide additional information to the OH committee sub group and to also offered to assist in the OH sub committee's work.

MMc suggested that the HESAC should invite Cadent to a future HESAC meeting to update the members on their investigations and learnings from the incident.

BH has concerns on the increasing number of HSE improvement notices on fatigue related incidents e.g Cadent & Sulem Voe.

GE summarised the discussions and on behalf of the HESAC reassured the members that the current ongoing industry work on this subject should encompass those who are close to the issue through increased collaboration between TUs and Companies.

The committee noted the concerns of the TUs and further updates on progress will be provided at the next meeting.

## **8 Powering Improvement**

### **8.1 Industry PI workshop 25 June 2019**

DS provided the members with an update on the latest progress towards publishing the final HSL report. The report is still to be presented to the ENA SHE Committee (funding body) for approval to publish. It is hoped that this will be concluded at their next meeting on 25 October. Following approval by the SHEC the report will be made available to all stakeholders.

Referencing the 25 June Powering Improvement workshop slides previously circulated to the HESAC, DS give a short update on the key outputs of the study.

The three key areas of the study were Processes, Leadership and Behaviours.

Each of the three categories had a number of positive findings but also a number of findings where the industry could do even better. Please refer to the slides for further details.

Stakeholders are keen to see the report before they can express a strong view on the study's findings.

The next steps are to complete ENA SHEC approval process and circulate the report to Powering Improvement steering group for review. Following that the aim would be to agree and develop the necessary outputs from the report building them into the 2020 Powering Improvement delivery plan.

***Action: Further progress update will be provided to HESAC via email following the next meeting of the PISG scheduled for 28/11/19.***

The members noted progress.

### **8.2 2020 – 2025 Powering Improvement Strategy**

DS updated the members on progress of drafting a phase three 5 year Powering Improvement strategy. Running through the draft which sets the context and the successes of the last ten years, includes a new Energy UK and ENA governance process which sets out how the two organisations can work either on an individual or collaborative basis. The strategy then sets out the key theme for years 2020 – 2022. Years 2023-2025 will not be set but will allow a pick and mix depending on the key issues at that time. Themes have been proposed by stakeholders and they are set out in the draft strategy.

What is also being considered for inclusion in this strategy are specific headline Health and Safety targets (outputs/inputs qualitative/quantitative).

Following discussions there was broad support for the strategy and it was agreed that the comments from the members should be feedback to the Powering Improvement steering group for consideration.

The members noted progress.

### **8.3 Powering Improvement Champions**

DS reminded the members that the current champions Sue Fearn (Unions) and Peter Emery (Companies) are due to step down from their role at the end of this year and there will be a need to identify two new champions for 2020.

**Action: DS to raise this with the PI Steering Group and the ENA SHEC. Energy UK to raise this with their Safety Leaders Group.**

## 8.4 Powering Improvement Communications Update

PK was unable to attend so DS suggested that he would ask Peter to provide a short written update on latest progress on the development of Powering Improvement communication plan. It was also recommended that any Powering Improvement phase 3 launch should be held off until mid-late Q1 2020.

**Action: DS to request a short written update from PK to share with the members.**

## 9. SHE Developments and Updates

### 9.1 ENA

#### 9.1.1 ENA SHE Structure

DS updated the members on the revised ENA SHE structure.

#### 9.1.2 Public Safety 2019 Video Launch

DS provided a brief update on the 2019 public safety “Look up Look out” video launch which took place on 6 August. This year’s campaign is aimed at Tipper and HIAB type vehicles and avoidance of overhead line contacts. The video launch was accompanied by a communications campaign. This year’s campaign follows on from the 2018 Agricultural campaign. The 2020 campaign will focus on avoidance of underground cable strikes. Link to the Tipper and Hiab 2019 campaign can be found [here](#).

#### 9.1.3 Underground distribution Link Boxes

DS provided a brief overview on the successful work of the ENA Link Box WG which has seen a reduction in the catastrophic failures of underground ink boxes and the production of new ENA technical specification including new design and testing requirements.

#### 9.1.4 SF6 Working Group

DS provided a brief update on the background and context for the establishment of a new ENA SF6 working group. The group has been set up to oversee from a networks perspective possible changes to the EU Fluorinated Greenhouse Gas Regulations.

### 9.2 Trade Unions

#### 9.2.1 Innovation

MMc updated the members on some concerns relating to new innovation ie impact of embedded generation , EVs etc and looking ahead 5 years it is anticipated further innovation both in new types of plant and also new types of systems eg (DSO). Trade Unions keen to build on previous work (2017 PI AM initiative). No firm proposals at this time but would welcome discussion with the companies. PF suggested the work in the innovation team on DSO could be helpful and he took an action to follow this up.

**Action: PF to discuss with the Head of Innovation and formally follow up with MMc.**

#### 9.2.2 Investigations

MMc on behalf of the TUs and using a set of slides provided an update on what they see as the role of the safety representative. Following the presentation MMc asked for comments relating to:

- The proposed principles;
- Drafting of standard wording; and
- Developing training including Human factors and communications.

**Action: DS to circulate the presentation slides with the minutes**

**Action: Members to provide feedback to MMc on the TUs proposal**

### **9.2.3 Information for Safety Representatives**

MMc updated the members on a draft document seeking out responses from local safety representatives relating to safety rep visibility (use of photographs), safety rep inspections and receiving communications from third parties eg ENA. It is hoped that this can be achieved locally in each company led by the local Union reps and SHE teams.

### **9.3 Energy UK**

As the BR was on leave and no update was available it was agreed to leave the Energy UK update to the next meeting.

### **9.4 HSE**

DL Provided a short update on behalf of HSE;

#### **9.4.1 DWP Consultation**

This not a HSE consultation. DLv on behalf of the DWP only requested ENA to forward to its members.

### **10. ENA & Energy UK LT and non LT accident and incident trends**

There was an action from the previous meeting for Energy UK and ENA to present their key accident performance stats/data. Following discussion it was agreed that DS would share the two graphs for comment to see if we can develop a common graph for use by the HESAC.

**Action: DS to share the two graphs with the members for comment.**

### **11. AOB**

#### **11.1 TU Nomination HESAC Chair 2020 -2022**

It was agreed that by the 31 October the TU will nominate a Chair for 2020-2022

**Action: MMc will inform BR/DS of the name of the new HESAC Chair by 31/10/19**

#### **11.2 Agree Joint secretaries for 2020**

The Secretary for 2020 will be Energy UK and joint Secretary will be a rep from the Trade Unions

#### **11.3 Retiring Chairman**

As this was Geoff's last meeting as chair the members thanked him for his excellent chairmanship of the committee over the last two years and wished him all the best for the future.

### **12. Dates of meetings in 2020:**

- January 22nd
- May 20th
- September 23rd

## Actions

	Action	Owner	Date
1	<p><b>HESAC TOR</b> Action: DS has recommended that actual names of members and alternates should not be included on the TOR but only include details of the member's companies/organisations. The members agreed to this and DS will update the TOR accordingly.</p> <p>Action: There were several additional comments provided by the members which DS will also reflect in a revised v7 of the ToR and following this update will circulate via email a revised version (v7) for final approval.</p>	<p>DS</p> <p>DS</p>	<p>31/10/19</p>
2	<p><b>HESAC Annual Report</b> Action: DS, BR and MM to prepare draft summary report template and circulate for comment. This will be circulated no later than Friday 11 October with one week for comments.</p> <p>Action: From 20 October commence drafting report for comment aiming for final publication by December 31/12 or first week in January.</p>	<p>DS</p> <p>DS</p>	<p>11/10/19</p> <p>20/10/19</p>
3	<p><b>Asbestos</b> Action: BR to provide a written update on the progress of the work of the AMO Asbestos Guidance Collaboration sub group and share with the members at the earliest opportunity via email but no later than 30/10.</p> <p>Action: ML will provide an update on the progress of the ENA Asbestos Task Group at the next meeting.</p>	<p>BR</p> <p>ML</p>	<p>WIP update at next meeting</p> <p>22/01/20</p>
8	<p><b>Hexavalent Chromium (CR6)</b> Action: MMc will discuss this issue with DSm and BR and will request that Hexavalent Chromium should be monitored for the foreseeable future at the Energy UK Safety Leaders forum and removed as a regular HESAC standing agenda item.</p>	<p>MMc/DSm</p>	<p>31/10/19</p>
9	<p><b>Occupational Health</b> Action: ML to feed the members comments back to the Mortality Study Group for consideration.</p> <p>Action: ML to invite DR Haley Tripp to the next meeting of the National HESAC for further update on the findings of the report.</p>	<p>ML</p>	<p>31/10/19</p> <p>22/01/20</p>
10	<p><b>Powering Improvement Industry Workshop</b> Action: Further progress update will be provided to HESAC via email following the next meeting of the PISG scheduled for 28/11/19.</p>	<p>DS</p>	<p>30/11/19</p>
12	<p><b>ENA &amp; EUK Accident Trends</b> Action: DS to share the EUK and ENA graphs with the members for comment.</p>	<p>DS &amp; BR</p>	<p>WIP update at next meeting</p>
13	<p><b>EMF Cohort Study</b> Action: ML to feed the members comments back to the Mortality Study Group for consideration.</p>	<p>ML</p> <p>ML</p>	<p>31/10/19</p> <p>22/01/20</p>

	Action: ML to invite DR Haley Tripp to the next meeting of the National HESAC for further update on the findings of the report.		
<b>14</b>	<b>Fatigue management</b> Compile a series of questions to be presented to the companies in relation to how they manage fatigue for discussion at next meeting.	<b>MM</b>	<b>WIP update at next meeting</b>
<b>16</b>	<b>Collation of Safety Rep contact details</b> To prepare draft template for collation of details of the national TU and Non TU appointed Safety Reps	<b>MM</b>	
<b>17</b>	<b>Powering Improvement Champions 2020-2022</b> Action: DS to raise this with the PI Steering Group and the ENA SHEC. Energy UK to raise with their Safety Leaders Group.  <b>Communications Plan</b> Action: DS to request a short written update from PK to share with the members.	<b>DS/All</b>  <b>DS/PK</b>	<b>31/10/19</b>  <b>31/10/19</b>
<b>18</b>	<b>Wood Pole hammer Test</b> DL to share HSE's information on Wooden Pole Hammer Testing concerns. He reported back via email that he is unable to share the information at this time. There are still some internal discussions on-going at HSE. To be left on the agenda for discussion at next meeting.	<b>DL</b>	<b>WIP update at next meeting</b>
<b>19</b>	<b>TU Update Innovation</b> Action: PF to discuss with the Head of Innovation and formally follow up with MMc.  <b>Safety Rep Investigations</b> Action: DS to circulate the Prospect presentation slides with the minutes Action: Members to provide feedback to MMc on the TUs proposal	<b>PF/MMc</b>  <b>DS</b> <b>All/MMc</b>	<b>31/11/19</b>  <b>31/10/19</b> <b>31/10/19</b>
<b>20</b>	<b>TU Nomination HESAC Chair 2020 -2022</b> Action: MMc will inform BR/DS of the name of the new HESAC Chair by 31/10/19	<b>MMc</b>	<b>31/10/19</b>
<b>21</b>			
<b>22</b>			
<b>23</b>			
<b>24</b>			